THE CONCEPT OF SAYING SORRY AMONG CHILDREN: A PRELUDE TO FORGIVENESS BEHAVIOR AND IMPLICATIONS TO TEACHING PRESCHOOLERS

Teresita Tabbada-Rungduin

The study investigated the ways in which young children define and understand the act of saying sorry. As their language skills expand and their ability to take the perspective of others improves, empathic responding increases and becomes an important motivator of prosocial or altruistic behavior. Moreover, their capacity to explain what forgiveness means through saying sorry would reflect their level of language development in relation to concretizing their ideas verbally. If they can explain how they understand what saying sorry means, then some activities in preschool may be geared towards promoting forgiveness. The findings revealed that the children had an abstract understanding of forgiveness – through the concrete action of saying sorry. From the responses that the children provided, it is surmised that the act of saying sorry is a powerful tool in maintaining interpersonal relationships and protecting it. Language is one way children learn about their social environments; the discourse their mothers and grandmothers have with them influenced how they understand forgiveness. Overall, the data indicated that context was important in understanding forgiveness and the actions promoting it. Teachers of preschoolers should also provide venues to explain the value of forgiving others and asking for forgiveness.

Keywords: forgiveness, sorry, language development, empathy, values development

Introduction

Research on forgiveness has focused on numerous dimensions from the personality of the transgressor and victim (Watkins and Regmi, 2004), role of moral emotions (Bassett, et.al.), cultural applications and viability of forgiveness counseling approaches (Worthington, 2010), to well-being (McCullough, 2000), and health (Worthington, 2007). Significantly, most of the studies conducted in the area of forgiveness focused on how adolescents (Ashy et.al.2010), adults (Frise and McMin, 2010), understand, ask for and grant forgiveness. For their part, Strelan and Covic (2006) emphasized the cognitive, affective, and behavioral dimensions of forgiveness and how these dimensions interact within and between components. On the other hand, McCullough's work (2000) suggested that studies should be conducted focusing on certain clinical and nonclinical populations, that may help in understanding how the language of forgiveness can be applied to the contours of specific types of relationships and specific problems in living.

One of the earliest attempts in deconstructing forgiveness had been found in Piaget's research on children's morality (Andrews, 2000) by turning his attention briefly to questions of forgiveness within a developmental context. Andrews (2000) elaborated that Piaget contemplated the relationship between justice and forgiveness, which he regarded as cognitive development equivalents (Enright in Andrews, 2000). For Piaget, both constructs hinged on mutual respect, or reciprocity.

The literature on forgiveness has focused on studying how it is given as well as how it is asked for. Furthermore, the majority of these researches were done among college students (Bassett, et.al. 2006; Worthington, et.al. 2010), social workers (Denton and Martin, 1998), and psychoeducational groups (Enright, 2001; McCullough and Worthington in Enright, 2001). There is a dearth of literature, however, as regards investigating how forgiveness is understood by children, in general and during early childhood in particular. A possible reason is that forgiveness is an abstract concept and that preschoolers may have a limited view on how forgiveness is asked for and granted. However,

one of the areas pointed out by McCullough (2000) is that forgiving resembles other prosocial psychological changes that occur in social life. Empathy-motivated helping is an example (McCullough, 2000), although empathy is an emotional response, it also involves cognitive skills such as the ability to label another's emotional state or role taking. Consequently, empathy as an emotional capacity becomes more common in early childhood (Berk, 2001). Hoffman (in Eisenberg and Mussen, 1989) stated that empathic reactions depend heavily on the actor's cognitive sense of the other as distinct from himself which undergoes dramatic changes developmentally. The development of the sense of other interacts with the individual's early empathic responses to lay the basis for altruistic motivation.

In the preschool years, empathy becomes an important motivator of prosocial or altruistic behavior. At about 2 or 3 years, children begin to consider others as distinct physical entities with their own feelings, thoughts and emotions (Eisenberg and Mussen, 1989). Some children this age are capable of rudimentary role taking, if not more highly motivated to put themselves in another's place and find the real source of another's distress. Hence, they can respond in ways that may relieve the other's distress rather than their own. Compared with toddlers, preschoolers rely more on words to communicate their empathic feelings. And if one of the important areas of preschool curriculum is the development of social and emotional aspects, it is integral that areas on forgiveness be examined. With the development of language, which enables children to derive meaning from symbolic cues of affect such as written or verbal communication, children can empathize with an increasingly wide range of emotions including complex ones like feelings of betrayal and forgiveness.

The Standards and Competencies for Five-Year Old Filipino Children of the Department of Education (2010) emphasized that the competencies be utilized, considering the different developmental domains. Two developmental domains or learning areas are seen to be possible areas in which understanding of forgiveness and its value can be integrated. These are the first domain on Values Education specifying the importance of interpersonal relationships, and the third

domain on Social and Emotional Development where children are expected to develop social and emotional skills to relate well with others.

With the above premises, the present study hopes to investigate the ways in which young children define and understand forgiveness. As their language skills expand and their ability to take on the perspective of others improves, empathic responding increases and becomes an important motivator of prosocial or altruistic behavior. Moreover, their capacity to explain what forgiveness is would reflect their level of language development in relation to concretizing their ideas into verbal expressions. If they are able to provide explanations as to how they understand what forgiveness is, then some activities in preschool may be geared towards promoting forgiveness.

Research Problem

This study seeks to determine how preschoolers define and understand the concept of forgiveness. Specifically the research focused on answering the following questions:

- 1. How do preschoolers understand the concept of saying sorry?
- 2. What instances do preschoolers think about when they think of saying sorry?
- 3. What are the emerging themes in what children say:
 - a. when they ask for forgiveness; and
 - b. when they grant forgiveness?
- 4. How do caregivers perceive the children's concept of forgiveness?
- 5. How do the caregivers teach the children the need for forgiving and asking for forgiveness?

Methods

Using the qualitative design, the study gathered data from September 20-24, 2010 to answer the problems set. Specifically, content-analysis of the conversations was applied to get the emerging themes from the scripts that the children delivered. Children enrolled in Kinder 1 (aged 4 to 5 years old) of the Center for Teaching and Learning were chosen as the participants of the study during the school year 2010-2011.

The main research tool of the study was an interview guide that looked into and examined how the children formed ideas on forgiveness, also, an interview was conducted with caregivers to see how they observe their children's understanding of forgiveness. A letter of consent signed by the researcher and noted by the preschool teacher was given to the parents prior to the interview.

The semi-structured interview was conducted with the children and their caregivers during their free time for at least 15 minutes for the children and 30 minutes for their caregivers. A pre-test of the interview was done with two Kinder 1 students and their parents from another institution to validate and check for content understanding. The pretest revealed that the word "sorry" is better understood than forgiveness or paghingi ng tawad. Hence, in the interview guide all items pertaining to forgiveness were changed into saying 'sorry' and wanting to say 'sorry'. The pre-tested children reported that they understand most of the items in the interview guide (except for the abstract concept of forgiveness and paghingi ng tawad). All the questions were asked in Filipino. Questions in the interview included:

Table 1

Categories of questions in the Interview Guide

Children

- Ano ang pagsasabi ng sorry? Bakit nag-so-sorry?
 (What do you mean when you say sorry?) Why do you say sorry?)
- Paano ba magsorry? Paano ba humingi ng sorry? (How do you say sorry?)
- Paano mo tinatanggap ang sorry ng iba?(How do you accept others saying they are sorry?)
- 4. Ano ang ginagawa mo sa mga nag-sorry sa iyo? (How do you deal with those who tell you that they are sorry?)

Parents

- 1. Sa inyong palagay, alam po ba ng inyong anak ang konsepto ng pagpapatawad?
 - (How does your child understand the concept of forgiveness?)
- 2. Sa paanong paraan niya natutunan ang pagpapatawad? (How did your child learn about forgiveness?)
- 3. Paano nalalaman ng inyong anak na kailangan niyang humingi ng tawad?(In what ways does your child know that he or she needs to ask
- 4. Ano ang ginagawa ng inyong anak pag hihingi siya ng tawad? (What does your child do when he or she asks for forgiveness?)

Six (6) out of ten (10) caregivers agreed to be interviewed during the span of time the children were interviewed. They were generous enough to provide concrete examples on how their children learned to understand the concept, when they thought their child needed to ask for forgiveness and what the child did when asking for forgiveness. Moreover, the caregivers were all females with one (1) grandmother and the rest being the children's mothers. Socialization coming from the female members of the family was more explored in this study.

for forgiveness?)

Based on the transcripts of the interviews, an in-depth analysis was made on the responses grouped according to themes and categories. The analysis was significant in identifying the salient statements, descriptions and expressions made by the respondents during the interview.

The data generated from the children and their parents were organized and explored using the within case and cross-case analyses to examine the themes and coherence of the respondents' responses with reference to the meaningfulness and saliency of the statements. The researcher also sought the expertise of another psychologist in cross-validating the responses of the students.

Results

Preschoolers' Construal of Forgiveness

Saying Sorry as a Concept

Data from the interview revealed that the act of saying sorry is expected when there is physical transgression, such as being in the way when someone is doing an activity, punching someone, and fighting (physically); unintentionally hurting or doing wrong to someone such as spilling water over a classmate's uniform, hitting someone, because of a game they were playing, or breaking a prized object (crown).

Pag may tinamaan tapos pag nakadapa ka. Pag nasuntok mo tapos natamaan mo sa mata. (4.7 years old)

(When you hit and caused someone to stumble. If you punched someone and you hit him or her in the eye.)

Sorry, magso-sorry. Kasi kumuha nang di nagpapaalam (4.8 years old)

(A classmate would say sorry if he or she had taken something from you without asking permission.)

Sorry. Kasi natapon yung tubig ni A___. Sorry. Nagso-sorry kasi umiyak (4.7 years old)

(Sorry should be told when someone spills water. I would say sorry because my classmate was crying.)

I'm sorry classmate. Hindi ko alam. Pag nasira ko ung korona (4.9 years old)

(I would say 'I am sorry classmate, I did not know.' I would say sorry because the crown was broken.)

The children's responses also revealed that the word *sorry* seemed to be a response that is attached to the act of asking for forgiveness. Moreover, forgiveness as attributed to the word *sorry* is understood as something that the transgressor appeals to. Analysis of the students' responses reveals that forgiveness involves the act of saying sorry and the conditions in which forgiveness should be asked.

Saying Sorry and Empathy-Related Behaviors

Based on the responses of students, asking for forgiveness means the act of producing or saying "I am sorry". When asked why they say sorry, the responses were more on the actions (e.g. when a playmate was accidentally hit or hurt, water was spilled, getting another person's things (without asking permission) and consequent behaviors manifested by the person they offended (e.g. when the playmate cried).

Analysis of the students' responses reveals that forgiveness involves the act of saying sorry and the conditions in which forgiveness should be asked. The act of saying sorry was also attributed to the way it was said, specifically. During the interventions, it was noted that the facial expressions of the children changed as some of them said sorry, revealing a more empathic expression. Tracing the development of the

concept of forgiveness would take into account the importance of how the concept is gradually being understood by the children. Much of their understanding could be attributed to the context in which forgiveness had been explained to them and how they observed it being asked and given.

Since forgiveness is an abstract concept, its mental meanings may include and may immediately be attached to instances where pictures of someone being hurt or how they feel when they are hurt. Consequently, as Berk (2001) had posited, empathy as an emotional capacity becomes more common in early childhood. In the preschool years, empathy becomes an important motivator of prosocial or altruistic behavior. Compared with toddlers, preschoolers rely more on words to communicate their empathic feelings.

Notably, despite the use of Filipino in expressing instances where forgiveness is warranted, still forgiveness is understood by the word *sorry*. There were no accounts where the counterpart of the word sorry in Filipino was mentioned. It could be inferred that the word *sorry*, has become a basic interpretation communication skills (BICS) or their playground language.

Caregivers' Perception of How Children Understand Forgiveness

Concept Understanding through Direct Teaching

The caregivers' responses to questions pertaining to their perceptions of their children's understanding of the forgiveness concept revealed that they all believe the youngsters to have a grasp of what the concept is. They also enumerated instances where they have explained and taught what the concept means and how it matters in relationships. The situations in which the mothers and grandparents believe to be essential to teach the concept were during conflicts among siblings, cousins and playmates. The caregivers also stressed the value of having a harmonious relationship in the home and of seeing the significance of taking turns and sharing.

Pinapaliwanag sa bata na kapag siya ay nakagawa ng mali o kasalanan sa iba may intensiyon man o wala kailangan niyang humingi ng patawad para mapawi ang nagawang mali sa iba (Mother of a 4.9 year-old student)

(I explain to my child that when she makes a mistake or had wronged someone whether it was her intention or not, she needs to ask for forgiveness to lessen the wrong she did.)

Dahil sa aming magulang niya. Lagi naming siyang pinagsasabihan tungkol sa paghingi ng tawad pati na rin sa mga napapanood niyang palabas (sa TV) na nagtuturo ng kagandahang asal. (Mother of a 4.7 year-old student)

(As his parents, we always explain the value of asking for forgiveness. He also learned about it from the values that the TV shows teach.)

Kinakausap naming siya agad kapag naririnig naming nagkakagalit sila ng kanyang kalaro o kapatid at pinagsasabihan na mag-sorry. (Mother of a 4.8 year-old student)

(We see to it that we would talk to her whenever we hear that she is involved in a conflict with her friends and siblings. We tell her to say sorry.)

Forgiveness is understood by children because of incidents where the caregivers observed that the child committed a transgression to his or her siblings or cousins and the caregivers directly tell them to ask for forgiveness. There is also a concerted effort as observed from the mothers' responses that the children need to ask for forgiveness especially when the transgression happened inside the house.

Concept Understanding through Modeling

Some caregivers who reported that forgiveness is better understood by the children because they see their parents doing it also (e.g. saying sorry or hugging the hurt person). They also reported that when they have misunderstandings with family members they make it a point that the children see their effort in wanting to repair the relationship by asking for forgiveness or by forgiving the person. Lastly, the mothers reported that forgiveness is better understood by their children, because they also acknowledge their role in asking for forgiveness whenever they had transgressed their child or by forgiving their children when they had done something wrong.

Kami mismong magulang nag-so-sorry kapag may nagawa kaming mali sa kanya. Halimbawa, hindi naming siya naibili ng pagkain na naipangako naming sa kanya (Mother of a 4.8 year-old student) (As parents, we ourselves say sorry whenever we had done something wrong to her. For example, when we were not able to buy her the food we promised her.) Nakikita niya yung mga nakatatanda niyang kapatid na nag-sorry pag sila ang may mali (Grandmother of a 4.6 year-old student) (He sees his older siblings say sorry when they had done something wrong.)

The caregivers' responses emphasized instances where their child knew when to forgive and the conditions in which forgiveness occurs. It was also mentioned that caregivers had different ways in teaching their children the concept of forgiveness – by directly teach them what forgiveness is, by modeling the behavior by asking for forgiveness, if they had transgressed the child, and by explaining the value of forgiveness.

Ipinapaliwanag naming sa kanya na kapag nag-sorry, nababawasan yung pain kapag nasaktan yung kalaro. Kaya natuto siya mag-sorry sa mga ginagawa niyang mali. (Mother of a 4.8 year-old child)
(We explain to him that when he says sorry the pain felt by his playmate decreases. So he learned to say sorry for wrongs done.)

Instances when Forgiveness should be asked

Preschoolers' Perspective: Saying Sorry should be Immediate

In what instances do the preschoolers perceive they have to ask for forgiveness? The majority of the answers revealed that saying sorry should be immediate and focused on physical hurt caused by the children to their playmates. The situations here were seen as relational and temporal conceptual units. The way the children understand the situations in which forgiveness is required express (a) changes of state (e.g. hurt from not being hurt); (b) presence or absence of relations among objects (e.g. if the classmate is hurt); and (c) temporal aspect or continuity (e.g. I want my classmates to be my friends).

Hindi na masyado masakit kasi nag-sorry na. (Girl, 4.8) (It does not hurt that much because my playmate said sorry.)

I want us to be friends (Boy, 4.6)

The responses also show that the children developed an idea as to what forgiveness is, however, they had not fully grasped the meaning of the concept. Responses pointing out that there is an age requirement for saying sorry (e.g. if I turn 5); shrugging; not knowing the answers to all the problems or when actions done resulted in hurting a classmate. The conceptualizations of forgiveness seem to fall in the pattern suggested by Enright (1991) in terms of intrapersonal processes: (a) experiencing an awareness of negative psychological consequences, (b) developing a sense of need for resolution, (c) deciding among resolution strategies, (d) examining motives for forgiveness, and (e) deciding to forgive. In the case of the interviewed children, processes

(a) and (b) seemed to be important for those who had a more realistic understanding of forgiveness. As the children's mental faculty develops, the understanding of an abstract concept such as forgiveness becomes more congruent with how we as adults understand it.

Caregivers' Perspective: Forgiveness and their Children's Transgression

When parents were asked about the instances they believe children should ask for forgiveness, the salient information was that the activities and how the parents exposed their children to the concept affected language production. In a study by Lund and Duchan (1993 as cited in Klein et.al.), telling children stories that include event relations such as temporal, causal or adversative would likely enhance the production of causal chains – in this case, the hurting and asking for forgiveness script. The children's responses to questions on when they ask for forgiveness seem to be a script programmed to be expressed when they have hurt a person (intentionally or unintentionally) or when they have shown inappropriate behaviors to their parents (being stubborn or not following the rules).

Sasabihin ko sa kanya'ano mararamdaman mo kapag sa iyo ginawa yun?' Tapos sasabihin ko gusto mo magsorry sa iyo, di ba. Kaya dapat nag-sorry ka, para kapag ikaw maiisip niya na nasaktan ka at gagawin nya din sa iyo ang pagsasabi ng sorry. (Mother of a 4.5 year-old student)

(I tell her, 'how would you feel if it was done to you?' then I will tell my child that she also wants her playmate to say sorry. I instill the value of saying sorry based on how her playmate feels and how she would have felt.)

Granting Forgiveness

Preschoolers' Perspective: Dealing with Forgiveness

When asked how they deal with people who have hurt them, but have asked for forgiveness, the children reported that they will say sorry too, or thank the offender for saying sorry. The children's action towards the offender revealed that they may give food to show that they have forgiven the person, will shake hands with the offending party or say "It's ok." On the other hand, the girls would likely say that "it is ok"; provide another object (pencil) as a replacement for the broken or lost object; and write a letter to the offending party.

Caregivers' Perspective: Behavioral Manifestations of Forgiveness

By contrast, their significant others' responses were more specific. For instance, the mothers reported that their children would hug them and say sorry. One parent was specific enough to detail how her child thinks through the situation and eventually asks forgiveness by hugging and saying sorry, while crying.

Notably, almost all the key informants were mothers and a grandmother. This may have bearing to the study done by Howe et.al. (2010) indicating that mothers play a large role in socializing their children to use internal state language via collaborative family discourse during ongoing interactions. The type of relationship that the mother and child have is viewed as providing a "window" into children's social and emotional understanding.

Discussion

First, the findings related to how children start to understand the concept of forgiveness through the act of saying sorry, instances requiring how sorry is asked and granted, and what children do to show that they have forgiven were discussed. Second, the role of the significant others specifically their mothers and grandparents were examined to show the impact of context and discourse on understanding a concept. Internal state language has been considered a unique marker of children's social understanding, because it provides insight into how children talk about emotions and think about their own and others' internal cognitive states.

Forgiveness, being an abstract concept, may be difficult for children to understand, however, the act of saying sorry seemed to be well understood by the children. If saying sorry has been understood as decreasing someone else's pain and taking responsibility for actions done to another person, then this may be a prelude to the forgiveness behavior, where children become more empathic and are motivated to forgive their transgressors.

The context in which the children's mothers and grandmother reared them had provided the essentials into understanding forgiveness. To this effect, the children saw forgiveness as important in maintaining harmonious interpersonal relationships as well as being considered a good person by their parents.

The findings also revealed that the children, despite their youth, had already an abstract understanding of forgiveness, and that is through the concrete action of saying sorry. From the responses that the children provided, it is surmised that the act of saying sorry is a powerful tool in maintaining interpersonal relationships and protecting it. Language is one way children learn about their social environments, the discourse their mothers and grandmothers have with them had influenced their understanding of forgiveness. The overall picture provided by the data indicated that context was important in understanding forgiveness. The situations requiring it and how to ask for forgiveness, also, how to accept actions related to accepting forgiveness were all influenced by the situations that the child was reared in.

Conclusion

From a social developmental perspective, parents often use daily conversations to coach and promote emotional and cognitive skills and awareness in their preschoolers. The children's understanding of forgiveness may be simple at this point-encompassing the whole concept through a single word — sorry. However, the situations surrounding the word and expectations people have to the word sorry may make the word more complex. Having parents and children use

effective communication to co-construct an understanding of forgiveness across contexts may have beneficial outcomes, when the child integrates forgiveness in his or her social relationships.

In understanding forgiveness, children expect forgiveness, when there is physical transgression and unintentionally hurting or doing wrong to someone. Children believed that the word *sorry* seemed to be a response that is attached to the act of asking for forgiveness.

Students asking for forgiveness relied more on the actions and consequent behaviors manifested by the person they offended. Children's perception of forgiveness involves the act of saying sorry and the conditions in which forgiveness should be asked. The act of saying sorry is also attributed to the way it was said.

The caregivers' perceptions of their children's understanding of the forgiveness concept revealed that they all believe the children to have a grasp of what the concept is. The caregivers explained and taught what the concept means and its importance in relationships. The situations in which the mothers and grandparents believe to be essential to teach the concept were shown during conflicts among siblings, cousins and playmates.

Forgiveness is understood by children because of incidents where the caregivers observed that the child committed a transgression to his or her family members. Better yet, the concept of forgiveness is taught through modelling.

Implications to Teaching in the Preschool

There are two learning areas in which the concept of forgiveness can be integrated and further understood. The learning area focused on Values Education which recognizes the importance of interpersonal relationships and where children are expected to show positive self-concept, respect and concern for self and others, how to follow and behave appropriately in various situations and places, love of God, country and fellowmen – all these instances provided indicators in

relation to forgiving others. Another area, the Social and Emotional Development, posited that children are expected to develop the social and emotional skills to relate well with others and appreciate cultural diversity among the school community and other people. This area did not have competencies or indicators related to forgiveness.

The list of standards on Values Education points out that after completing preschool education, the child is expected to be respectful and loving of themselves and of others. In analyzing the competencies, it was stated that in teaching Pakikipagkapwa, the first competency focused on showing how a child loves his or her family members by saying "I'm sorry," "I did not mean it," "Thank you," and "You're welcome." Since forgiveness is an integral component of human relations, activities focusing on forgiving and understanding others should be emphasized. After all, since forgiveness promotes feelings of empathy, it should then be integrated also in lessons focusing on respecting others and giving importance to being able to play games properly and appropriately. Moreover, stories on forgiveness should be encouraged so that the preschooler will have an appreciation of the value that asking forgiveness and granting forgiveness have in relationships e.g. they can continue to be friends, if they forgive one another. Although the area on forgiveness is not as emphasized as acting appropriately in different situations, undeniably being able to understand the concept will help one become more emotionally attuned in relation to being hurt and unintentionally hurting someone.

Given the findings of the study, even if the concept might have been taught and talked about inside the classroom, the children still need concrete examples of what forgiveness is. Talking about the concept and discussing its emotional implications may help the children to become ready to understand the concept, as they step into middle childhood. This is congruent with what Piaget advocated as far as cognitive development is concerned, that is, as the child's sense of animism, artificialism and egocentrism decreases, the sense of realism increases which makes it possible for children to understand more abstract concepts.

Conversely, the learning area on social and emotional development placed expressing oneself, controlling one's emotions, understanding other children's emotions, and empathizing with others as its core competencies. The components include knowing oneself and expressing one's emotions, understanding other people's emotions; relating with others; and giving importance to diversity or to each other's uniqueness. Upon examining the indicators, it was observed that concepts of asking for or granting forgiveness were not part of the competencies. Since empathy is an integral part in being able to forgive others, activities in this area are warranted. Forgiveness, as seen from the literature review, indicates maintaining an adjusted psychological well-being and has been related to the reduction of depression, anger, anxiety, and improvement of self-esteem. If one of the end goals of the area is to develop a well-adjusted preschooler who is ready to take on the challenges of elementary grades, integrating lessons in forgiveness may be helpful.

Teachers of preschoolers should equally provide venues to explain the value of forgiving others and asking for forgiveness. In situations where children fight, the teacher may provide explanations as to how extent of transgression and the hurt it has caused the other child. It is observed that when children fight or have a misunderstanding the teacher tells the transgressor to say sorry, even if sometimes he or she does not want to. By providing experiences, e.g. storytelling activities, the children will be able to empathize with the aggrieved and voluntarily say sorry.

References

Andrews, Molly (2000). Forgiveness in Context. Journal of Moral Education. Volume 29, Number 1, pp: 75 -86.

Ashy, Majed, Mercurio, Andrea E. and Morrison, Kathleen. (2010). Apology, forgiveness, and reconciliation: An ecological world view framework. Individual Differences Research. Volume 8, Number 1, pp: 17 – 26.

- Baskin, Thomas, and Enright, Robert (2004). Intervention studies on forgiveness: A meta-analaysis. Journal of Counseling and Development. Volume 82, pp: 79 90.
- Bassett, Rodney; Bassett, Kelly; Lloyd, Matthew; and Johnson, Jason (2006). Seeking Forgiveness: Considering the Role of Moral Emotions. Journal of Psychology and Theology. Volume 34, Number 2, pp: 111 124.
- Frise, Nathan R. and McMinn, Mark R. (2010). Forgiveness and reconciliation: The differing perspectives of Psychologists and Christian theologians. Journal of Psychology and Theology. Volume 28, Number 2, pp: 83 90.
- Howe, Nina et. al. (2010). Patterns in mother-child internal state discourse across four contexts. Merill-Palmer Quarterly. Vol. 56, No. 1, pp: 1-20.
- Hui, Eadaoin and Chau, Tat Sing (2009). The impact of forgiveness intervention with Hong Kong Chinese children hurt in interpersonal relationships.

 British Journal of Guidance and Counseling. Volume 37, No. 2, pp: 141

 156.
- Klein, Harriet, et.al. (2010). Influence of context on the production of complex sentences by typically developing children. Language, Speech, and Hearing Services in Schools. Vol. 41, pp: 289 302
- McCullough, Michael (2000). Forgiveness as a Human Strength: Theory, Measurement, and Links to Well-Being. Journal of Social and Clinical Psychology, Volume 9, Number 1, pp: 43 55.
- Rata, Arama; Liu, Liu, James; and Hanke, Katja (2008). Te Ara Hohou Rongo (The Path to Peace): Maori Conceptualizations of Inter-Group Forgiveness. New Zealand Journal of Psychology. Volume 37, Number 2.
- Romig, Charles and Veenstra, Glenn (1998). Forgiveness and Psychosocial Development: Implications for Clinical Practice. Counseling and Values. Volume 42, Issue 3, pp: 185 202.
- Strelan, Peter and Covic, Tanya (2006). A Review of Forgiveness Process Models and a Coping Framework to Guide Future Research. Journal of Social and Clinical Psychology. Volume 25, Number 10, pp: 1059 1085.