Article Code: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

 Article Title: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

 Reviewer: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

 Affiliation: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Criteria and Indicators** | **Excellent****(4)** | **Good****(3)** | **Fair****(2)** | **Poor****(1)** |
| **Contribution to Teacher Education/Education**1. Originality of the work
2. The article is able to address the needs/concerns in education/teacher education at present
3. Important and timely
4. Value or usefulness of the research to the field or profession or to the existing knowledge in teacher education/education
 |  |  |  |  |
| **Clarity, Completeness and Validity of information**1. Connection to concrete national, regional or global significance.
2. Overall clarity of ideas and expression
3. Correct grammatical construction and accurate writing style
4. Relevant and well-presented literature review
5. Solid connections of theories and concepts in the framework of the study
6. Clear and well-formulated research questions
7. Clear and detailed *data collection procedures*: design, sampling, instruments, and data collection.
8. Concrete and sufficient *data analysis procedures*
9. Consistency with and use of relevant literature in presenting analysis of data and results.
10. Strength of argumentation: clarity of concepts, internal logic and organization
11. Precise and accurate Interpretation, presentation, and discussion of findings
12. Adequacy, coherence and concreteness of tables and figures as used in the interpretation, presentation and discussion of findings.
13. Inclusion of appropriate implications for practice and/or policy
 |  |  |  |  |

 Please provide further comments on the article.

Please provide any confidential comments to the Editorial Board.

 **Interpretation**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Range** | **Interpretation** |
| **3.50 – 4.00** | Accept, without revisions |
| **2.50 – 3.49** | Accept, with minor revisions |
| **1.50 – 2.49** | Accept, after major revisions are addressed |
| **1.00 – 1.49** | Reject, not fit for publication in this journal |

**Reviewer’s Decision:**

* Accept, without revisions
* Accept, with minor revisions
* Accept, after major revisions are addressed
* Reject, not fit for publication

 **After the revision is submitted:**

* I want to read the article again.
* I leave it up to the editor to decide.